



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

else has the subject been so elaborately treated. The same high praise, which we have bestowed on the biographical portion of Mr. Frothingham's labors must be awarded to this part of his volume. His account of the Boston Massacre and of the destruction of the tea, in particular, may be noticed as striking examples of minute and luminous narrative: they need only the attraction of a more animated and picturesque style to insure for them a permanent place among the best historical monographs. Every important transaction, however, is described in the same careful and judicious manner; and no one can fail to be impressed by the thoroughness with which Mr. Frothingham has treated every part of his subject.

---

6.—*History of Congregationalism, from about A. D. 250 to the Present Time.* By GEORGE PUNCHARD. Second Edition. Rewritten and greatly enlarged. New York: Hurd and Houghton. 1865. 2 vols. 12mo.

THE rise of Congregationalism, as a polity recognized by that name, properly dates from about the close of the sixteenth century; and the title adopted for this book is open to the objection of being a somewhat presumptuous appropriation, in the interest of Congregationalism, of the honor which belongs to a long line of noble vindicators of truth and freedom, who knew nothing of Congregationalism as such, and who cannot fairly be claimed as the supporters of that specific polity. But the author is perhaps sufficiently justified in his use of the title, in view of the very striking identity of spirit manifested in many of the various forms of what may be called early religious dissent with that of Congregationalism.

One prominent characteristic of the chief of the so-called heresies of the first fifteen centuries was the uniform practice of making appeal steadfastly to the Bible, as the ultimate authority in all matters of church government and order. On this position they all stood firm, however great their diversities in other points. Whether known by the name of Novatians, Donatists, Arians, Waldenses, Wickliffites, Separatists, Nonconformists, or Independents, these sects were one in the adoption of this principle; and owed their measure of success, in the main, to the tenacity with which they clung to it as a fundamental principle. The resemblance between Congregationalism and these dissenting sects does not, it is true, involve a complete parallelism. It is hardly close enough to justify the Congregationalist in claiming for his polity anything like an unbroken "Apostolical succession." He must be content

to allow that what he claims as the polity of the Apostolical churches had for many ages no practical embodiment in an organized form, and that it was not fairly resuscitated for many long centuries. But independent of each other, to a great extent, as they were, these struggles bear witness to the irrepressible tendency of the human mind, under the impulse of the higher sentiments, in the direction of a free and simple system of church government; and Congregationalism has a fair title to the honor of being the matured result of this long-continued resistance against ecclesiastical tyranny. The history of Congregationalism is, therefore, essentially the history of the Reformation itself in its unchecked development. Le Bas, an English churchman, in summing up his account of the character and tenets of Wickliffe, remarks: "At all events, it must plainly be confessed that there is a marvellous resemblance between the Reformer, with his poor, itinerant priests, and at least the better part of the Puritans, who troubled our Israel in the days of Elizabeth and her successors. The likeness is sufficiently striking almost to mark him out as their prototype and progenitor; and therefore it is that every faithful son of the Church of England must rejoice with trembling that the work of her final deliverance was not consigned to him." And what is here said of Wickliffe might, with some qualification, be affirmed of the earlier portion, also, of that list of the apostles of freedom whose names find a place in this work. "The likeness" to the immediate founders of Congregationalism "is sufficiently striking to mark them out as their prototypes and progenitors."

Mr. Punchard deserves well of Congregationalists, and of all the friends of religious liberty, for the work he has undertaken. His conception was one of great interest. Well carried out, it would accomplish more than any mere discussion of principles towards recommending and perpetuating this simple and Scriptural form of church order. Although the author has by no means wholly failed in the execution of his plan, there are, however, two very evident faults which detract seriously from the literary merit of the work, and greatly diminish its value.

A wholly disproportionate space is given to the history of events antecedent to the origin of Congregationalism as a distinct polity. Two volumes, each of more than five hundred pages, are devoted to this preliminary part; while the whole that remains is to be comprised in a single volume. The story of those thirteen centuries of brave struggle against the tide of prevailing corruption and abuse of power is worthy, it is true, of faithful delineation, and deserves to be attentively read. But, for all the legitimate need of a history of Congregationalism, one half of the space here allotted would be amply sufficient.

Our second criticism relates to the manner in which these details are

laid before us. They are thrown together with little regard to any order but that of time simply. The author has collected a large mass of valuable material, and would seem to have been faithful in his investigation of authorities, and generally correct in his conclusions. But in a book like this we have a right to demand of the author something beyond the simple painstaking of a careful compiler. The views of the various sects and individuals whose history is here chronicled are set before us with a good degree of distinctness; and we are told that the sentiments of this and that one are — to use the author's expression — “pretty fair Congregationalism.” But there is a want of definiteness in tracing the particular points of resemblance. The result is, that the impression left on the reader's mind is too vague. Too large a part of the task which was fairly to be expected of the author is left to be performed by the reader for himself. The work has thus an unfinished character. There is a want of elaboration, — of art. The material is there, but it is not worked up. The citations, also, are unreasonably long and needlessly multiplied; and the reader is wearied by the succession of unimportant details copied so lavishly from works not difficult of access.

We will not dwell upon minor faults of style further than to notice one blemish which is somewhat characteristic of a certain class of religious writers, and by which these pages are too often disfigured. We refer to the habit of applying to the Roman Church and its dignitaries such appellations as “the Beast,” “the Mystery of Iniquity,” “the Man of Sin,” — expressions for which there is indeed a Scriptural warrant, according to the view of many Protestant interpreters; but which, when employed as epithets, partake of a tone more likely to foster prejudice than to lend substantial aid to the cause of Protestantism, and which are too much the provincialisms of a party to befit the diction of the ecclesiastical historian.

- 
- 7.—1. *Essays on Some of the Difficulties in the Writings of the Apostle Paul, and in other Parts of the New Testament.* By RICHARD WHATELY, D. D., Archbishop of Dublin. From the Eighth London Edition. Andover: Warren F. Draper. 1865. 12mo. pp. 376.
  - 2.—*A Critical and Grammatical Commentary on St. Paul's Epistle to the Galatians, with a Revised Translation.* By Rt. Rev. CHARLES J. ELLICOTT, Bishop of Gloucester and Bristol. *With an Introductory Notice by* CALVIN E. STOWE, D. D., Professor of Sacred Literature in Andover Theological Seminary. Andover: Warren F. Draper. 1855. 8vo. pp. 183.